AUSTRALIAN BUSINESS LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 20
1992

THE LAW BOOK COMPANY LIMITED
1993

Published in Sydney by
The Law Book Company Limited
44-50 Waterloo Road, North Ryde, N.S.W.

All inquiries regarding the editorial content of this journal should be directed to The Law Book Company Limited 44-50 Waterloo Rd North Ryde 2113 Australia. Fax: (02) 888 2229

To order this or any Law Book Company title phone 008 252 314 (887 0177 if calling from Sydney).

SALES CENTRES AND AGENTS

HEAD OFFICE: 44-50 Waterloo Road NORTH RYDE NSW 2113 Tel: (02) 887 0177 Fax: (02) 888 2287
4th Floor 167 Phillip Street SYDNEY NSW 2000 Tel: (02) 235 0766 Fax: (02) 221 4004
568 Lonsdale Street MELBOURNE Vic 3000 Tel: (03) 670 7888 Fax: (03) 670 0138
1st Floor 40 Queen Street BRISBANE Qld 4000 Tel: (07) 221 6688 Fax: (07) 220 0084
9th Floor St George's Centre 81 St George's Terrace PERTH WA 6000 Tel: (09) 321 8583 Fax: (09) 324 1910
Sales Representative Keith Peterson GPO Box 384 ADELAIDE SA 5001 Tel/Fax: (08) 295 7644 (mobile) 018 84 3052
Preferred Stockist The Bookworld 30 Smith Street DARWIN NT 0800 Tel: (089) 81 5277 Fax: (089) 411 226
Sales Representative Peter Stewart CPO Box 3139 AUCKLAND NZ Tel: (09) 366 7204 Fax: (09) 309 5336

ISSN 0310-1053

© 1992-93 The Law Book Company Limited and Contributors

Production Editor: Wendy Fitzhardinge

Typeset by Midland Typesetters, Maryborough, Victoria
Printed by Star Printery Pty Ltd, Erskineville, N.S.W.

AUSTRALIAN BUSINESS LAW REVIEW

EDITORIAL BOARD

JUDGE ARTHUR ROGERSON (*S.A.*)

R. M. B. REYNOLDS (*W.A.*)

PROFESSOR K. C. T. SUTTON (*Queensland*)

PROFESSOR R. BAXT (*Victoria*)

Singapore Representative: PROFESSOR E. P. ELLINGER

SECTION EDITORS

Administrative Law: J. BARNES

Banking and Finance: MARK SNEDDON

Book Reviews: G. T. PAGONE

Company Law and Securities: R. BAXT

Consumer Dealings: TONY DUGGAN

Industrial Law and Relations: M. PITTARD AND R. MCCALLUM

Insurance: K. C. T. SUTTON

Intellectual and Industrial Property: SAM MURUMBA

Media and Broadcasting Law: W. J. FORREST

Restrictive Trade Practices: PHILIP CLARKE

Taxation: ABE GREENBAUM

Transport: MARTIN DAVIES

New Zealand Newsletter: REX AHDAR

CONSULTING EDITOR: PROFESSOR R. BAXT

EDITOR: PROFESSOR PHILIP CLARKE

TABLE OF ARTICLES

	Page
An Overview of Legislation Controlling the Retailing of Petroleum within Australia John G. Grace	7
The Market for Sound Recordings: Open or Closed? Mark J. Davison	30
Directors' Personal Liability to Creditors for Company Debts Irene Trethowan	41
Nominee Directors: The Law and Commercial Reality Philip D. Crutchfield	109
Automatic Crystallisation of Company Charges: Contractual Creativity or Confusion? Fiona R. Burns	125
Aspects of the Extraterritorial Application of Sections 50 and 50A of the Trade Practices Act Robertson Wright	152
Auditors and the Reporting of Illegality and Financial Fraud Roman Tomasic	198
Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Judgments in Germany: Acting for Australian Clients Against German Defendants Joachim Rosengarten	230
The Injunction against Misleading Conduct—The Quiet Achiever Helen Jordan	244
Section 50—Controlling Mergers in the Future? A. I. Tonking	285
Foreign Investment Power and Control of Foreign Investment in Newspapers Dr John S. Mo	302
Priority Rights in Insolvency—The Doctrinal Basis for Equity's Intervention Vince Annetta	311

OFFICIAL MANAGEMENT V. REORGANISATION UNDER CHAPTER 11 OF THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY CODE: IN DEFENCE OF OFFICIAL MANAGEMENT
Bernard McCabe 320

WIELDING THE AXE ON AUSTRALIA'S TAX LAWS
Michael L. Perez 362

DECEIT: THE LOSS AND THE PROFITS
Jeff Cumberbatch 372

THE PRIORITY OF RETRENCHMENT PAYMENTS IN A LIQUIDATION OR RECEIVERSHIP
Leigh Duthie 378

A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE CIVIL PENALTY RÉGIME UNDER THE CREDIT ACT 1984 (VIC.)
James Omond 396

THE VIENNA CONVENTION: UNIFORMITY IN INTERPRETATION FOR GAP-FILLING—AN ANALYSIS AND APPLICATION
Mark N. Rosenberg 442

THE COURT-ROOM ECONOMIST IN AUSTRALIAN ANTITRUST LITIGATION: AN UNDERUTILISED RESOURCE?
Karen Yeung 461

CASES SPECIALLY NOTED

VOLUME 20

The cases here set out are cases that have been given special consideration in the Australian Business Law Review

	Page
Advance Bank Australia v. Fleetwood Star Pty Ltd and Anor	516
Australian Central Credit Union v. Commonwealth Bank of Australia	82
AWA Ltd v. Daniels (trading as Deloitte Haskins and Sells) and Ors	419, 520
Commonwealth Bank of Australia v. Friedrich and Ors	78
Custom Credit Corporation Ltd v. Gray	340
Custom Credit Corporation Ltd v. Luff	339
Custom Credit Corporation Ltd v. Lupi	338
Douglas Financial Consultants Ltd v. Price	84
Dunn v. Pain	345
East End Real Estate Pty Ltd v. C. E. Heath Casualty & General Insurance Ltd	421
Fruehauf Finance Corporation Pty Ltd v. Zurich Australian Insurance Ltd	86
Group Four Industries Pty Ltd v. Brosnan and Anor	79
Hendry Rae & Court v. FAI General Insurance Co. Ltd	346
Magill TV Guide Ltd v. Independent Television Publications Ltd, British Broadcasting Corporation and Radio Telefis Eireann	266
NM Superannuation Pty Ltd v. Hughes	516
Public Service Association of South Australia v. Federated Clerks' Union of Australia	170
Singapore Airlines Ltd v. Taprobane Tours W.A. Pty Ltd	351
Statewide Tobacco Services Ltd v. Morley	78

Turanga v. State Insurance..... 423

Vintix Pty Ltd v. Lumley General Insurance Ltd..... 262
Vital Finance Corporation Pty Ltd v. Taylor..... 342

Zvecova v. Industrial Commission of N.S.W..... 170

INDEX

VOLUME 20

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW
judicial review, privative clauses, 169-175

AUDITORS
audit failure
auditors, responsibility for
dilution in standards, 199
extent of, 198-199, 200
case studies
Nugan Hand Bank Royal Commission, 209-212, 228
Rothwells special investigation, 216-219, 228
The Trustees Executors and Agency Co. Ltd special investigation, 212-216
Tricontinental Royal Commission, 219, 228
negligence actions, 199, 203, 220
regulatory responses to, 220-221
theories as to
domineering senior management, 226-227
individual level, 226
inter-organisational level, 225-226
intra-organisational level, 226
detection and reporting of corporate fraud
audit committees, 223
auditing standards, 200, 202, 204, 205, 225
Australian developments, 203-205
common law duty, 204-205
conflict of interest, 224
difficulties of, 198-199, 202-203, 224-225
empirical data, 221-225
expectations of shareholders and public, 200
North American developments, 201-203
offences
Corporations Law, s. 83(1), 207-208
Corporations Law, s. 1308, 208-209
recent cases, 520-522
reform
Corporations Law, 203
governments, non-interventionist philosophy of, 201
need for, 198
resistance to, 203-204
statutory duty
Corporations Law, s. 332, 205-208
penalties for breach, 207

BANKING AND FINANCE
letters of credit, receiving documents tendered under, responsibilities of issuing bank, 175-179
reform, Martin Committee report, 103-104

BOOK REVIEWS
Clarke, P., Vertical Price Fixing, 279
Sturley, M. F., The Legislative History of the Carriage of Goods by Sea Act, 529-534

CHARGES
floating charges
automatic crystallisation
advantages of, 130
attitudes towards, 125
events triggering, 138-139
intervention, 139-140
notice, 139-140
problems associated with, 138-144
reform, 144-150
theoretical basis for, 128-129
third parties, effect on, 140-144
validity, 130-137
what constitutes, 129-130
crystallisation
automatic crystallisation, comparison with, 129-130
events triggering, 129, 138-139
nature of, 125-129
theoretical basis for
contingent equitable charge, 127-128
licence, 126, 127, 128
mortgage of future assets, 126-127

COMPANIES AND SECURITIES LAW
directors
creditors, duty to
enforcement of duty
bankruptcy claw back provisions, 51-52
Corporations Law, s. 232, 56, 57, 59
Corporations Law, s. 1324, 56-59
damages, 59
fiduciary relationship, establishing, 54-56
intervention by court, 50-51
remedies, 53-59
standing, 53-54, 56-59
extent of, 44-51
New Zealand, 46-48

COMPANIES AND SECURITIES LAW—*continued*
reform, 60-61
United Kingdom, 46
duty to company
duty to act in best interests of company
bona fides, 43
"company", 44-51
creditors—*see* creditors
nominee directors—*see* nominee directors
historical origin, 41-43
recent cases, 78-81, 182-183, 419-420, 516-522
reform, 105, 179-183, 196, 259-261
nominee directors
appointor interests, relevance of
duty to company, reconciling with
constituent documents of company, 116-120
problem, nature of, 112-113
strict view, 113
Re Broadcasting Station 2GB case, 113-115
reform, 121-122
duty to act in best interests of company
bona fides, 110
"interests of the company", 111
tests, 110
improper use of information
Corporations Law, s. 232(5) and (6), 122-124
information advantaging appointor, 123-124
liability
Corporations Law, s. 241, 121
exemption, 121
indemnity, 121
liquidation and receivership, retrenchment payments, priority of
Corporations Law, s. 556(1)(h)
compensation, 392-393
construction, 382-384
damages, 389-392
payment in lieu of notice, 386-389
"retrenchment payment", 382-384, 395
severance pay, 384-385
types, 384-393
official management
creditors, rights of
Corporate Law Reform Bill 1992 (Cth), 333-335
court intervention, rationale for
debtors' interests, 323-324
generally, 322-323
public interest, 324-327
credit bargain, 321-322

COMPANIES AND SECURITIES LAW—*continued*
reorganisation, comparison with
aims, 330-332
control, 328-329
initiative in invoking, 327-328
powers, available, 329-330
secured creditors, rights of, 332-333
reform
Cooney Committee Report
analysis of, 179-180
response to, 105, 180-182
Corporate Law Reform Bill 1992 (Cth), 196, 259-261, 320, 333-335

CONSUMER CREDIT
civil penalty régime under Credit Act 1984 (Vic.)
"civil penalty", 396
continuing credit contracts, 397
credit sales contracts, 396-397, 415-417
Credit Tribunal, application to, 397
criticisms of current system
Australian Finance Conference, concerns of, 413-415
distortions between States, 412-413
recovery by credit provider, 412
refinance, 411-412
loan contracts, 396-397, 415-417
Money Lenders Act 1958 (Vic.), comparison with
error
nature of, 398-399
overcoming, 399-403
non-compliance, effect of, 399
reform
application, prescribed form of, 404-405
Credit Bill 1991 (Vic.), draft, 409-410
Credit Tribunal, directions by, 405, 407
declarations, 408-409
general orders, 408
Molomby Report, 403-404, 417-418
New South Wales legislation, 409
recent reform, 404-410
reinstated charges, calculation of, 405-407
specific error determinations, 407
stay of civil penalty, 407-408
reinstatement of forfeited credit charges, 397
United States experience, 410-411
recent cases, 338-344

DECEIT
damages for loss of profits

DECEIT—*continued*
assessment of, 375-377
recoverability of, 373-375

INDUSTRIAL LAW
enterprise bargaining, metal trades industry, 5
Industrial Relations Legislation Amendment Act 1992 (Cth)
certified agreements, 523-528
independent courts, 522-523
wages, recovery of, 523

INSOLVENCY LAW
creditors, rights of
personal rights, 311
proprietary rights
doctrinal basis for, 311-319
modern approach to
conceptual deficiencies, 315-316, 317-319
dispositions, 315-316
judicial fiction, 317-318
judicial recognition, 313-314
retrospectivity, 317-318
unjust enrichment, prevention of, 312-313
traditional approach
proprietary base, 312, 316-318
retrospectivity, 316-318

INSURANCE
recent cases, 86-90, 262-265, 345-347, 421-424

INTELLECTUAL AND INDUSTRIAL PROPERTY
Copyright Act 1968 (Cth), ss 102, 103
effect of, 31-32
High Court approach to, 31-32
intellectual property rights, competition law, reconciling with, 265-270
sound recordings
Copyright Law Review Committee Report 1968
comparison with PSA recommendations, 34
development of Australian music, 38-39
piracy, 37
"reasonable time", 33-34
recommendations, 30-34
"substantially similar", 30, 32, 33-34
international conventions, 36-37
parallel importation
Copyright Act 1968 (Cth), 31-32
CLRC Report, 32-34
present situation, 31

INTELLECTUAL AND INDUSTRIAL PROPERTY—*continued*
PSA Report, 34-35
what constitutes, 30
Prices Surveillance Authority Report 1990
comparison with CLRC Report, 34
development of Australian music, 38-39
effect
local music, on, 35-36
manufacturing, on, 34
international conventions, 36-37
piracy, 37-38
recommendations, 30, 34

MEDIA AND BROADCASTING
print media, foreign investment regulation
Constitution (Cth), s. 51, 302, 303-304, 307
Executive, Federal
policy unsupported by legislation, 306-307
powers, 306-307
foreign takeovers
examination of, 305
Foreign Takeovers and Acquisitions Act 1975 (Cth), 304-306
method of regulation
legislation, 307-309
policy, 307-309
Parliament, Federal, powers of, 302-303, 304-305
reform
Lee Committee Report, 348-350
Matthews Report, 183-185
Treasurer, Federal, powers of, 302-303, 304-305

MISLEADING OR DECEPTIVE CONDUCT
Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth), s. 52
injunction, to prevent contravention of
final injunction, 254
form
corrective advertisement order, 255-256
mandatory, 255
restraining conduct, 254-255
grant
approach of court to, 246-247
power of court to, 246-247
prerequisites to, 248-249
interim injunction
balance of convenience, 251-254, 257-258
discretion of court, 249-254
serious question to be tried, 250-251
Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth), s. 80, 246-249, 253

MISLEADING OR DECEPTIVE CONDUCT—*continued*
trader, use to
advantages, 256-257
hazards, 257
types available, 247-248
limitations of, 245-246
misleading conduct, 244-245

PETROLEUM RETAILING IN AUSTRALIA
government intervention
effect of, 28
nature of, 28
role of, 29
Oilcode
success of, 27
terms of, 27
Petroleum Retail Marketing Franchise Act 1980 (Cth)
amendments to, 24
application of, 20
circumventing operation of, 24
franchise agreements
goodwill, 25-26
renewal, 23
termination, 23, 26
objectives of, 19-20
price discrimination, 24-25
strict observance of, necessity for, 24-25
Petroleum Retail Marketing Sites Act 1980 (Cth)
effect of, 22
penalties for breach, 22
prohibited conduct, 22
reform, 22-23
resale price maintenance, 15
secondary boycotts, 10-11
Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth)
anti-competitive arrangements and understandings, 8
application, 7-8
consumer protection, 18
exclusive dealing
supply contracts, 14
types of, 13-14
misuse of market power
conduct constituting, 12
conduct not constituting, 11
guidelines, 11-12
price discrimination
dealer price support schemes, 17
Price Discrimination Guideline, draft, 17-18, 24-25

PETROLEUM RETAILING IN AUSTRALIA—*continued*
what constitutes, 16
price fixing
exceptions to prohibition, 9
penalties for, 10
price leadership, 9
Trade Practices Commission, prosecutions by, 10
unfair practices
misleading or deceptive conduct, 18
unconscionable conduct, 18-19
Voluntary Code of Conduct—*see* Oilcode

PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW
institution of proceedings in Germany
conflict of laws
contracts, 241-242
limitation of actions, 239
principles of, 240-241
rules of civil procedure, 239
security for costs, 239
torts, 242
jurisdiction
Brussels Convention 1968, 237
excessive, 238
exclusive, 238
forum non conveniens, 239
rule, as to, 237
security for costs, 239
special, 238
statutory law, German, 237-239
submission to, 238
recognition and enforcement of foreign judgments in Germany
bilateral treaties, 232
Brussels Convention 1968, 231
statutory law, German, 232-236

PRODUCT LIABILITY LAW
legislation, proposed, 283

RESTRICTIVE TRADE PRACTICES
litigation
evidence of economists, use of
Australian experience, 464-466
benefits of, 462-464, 513-514
difficulties associated with, 461-463
expert witnesses
advocate, as, 489-493
behavioural scientist, as 494-498

RESTRICTIVE TRADE PRACTICES—*continued*
interpreter of statutes, as, 466-472
judge, as, 503-506
theoretician, as
economic logic, assessing, 486-488
generally, 472-473
market, defining, 474-481
market power, assessing, 481-486
reform
need for, 507
institutional, 510-513, 515
procedural, 508-510, 514
mergers and acquisitions
authorisation
Western Australian Newspapers Ltd case, 91-100
procedure, difficulties with, 297-298
test, 296-299
merger law
economic efficiency of, 290
objectives of, 289-290
reform, 300-301, 425-426
merger policy
future direction of, 291-292
New Zealand, 291-292
objectives of, 271-273
penalties, 277-278, 424
reform
Cooney Committee Report
analysis of, 6, 106-108, 270-278
government response to, 283-284, 424-426
remedies, 277-278
Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth), s. 50
acquisitions in breach of, 91-100
competition
dominance test, 272, 286-287, 292-293
importance of, 293-295
sensitive industries, 295-296, 298-299
substantially lessening test, 271-273, 286, 292-295, 425
tests of, 271-273, 286-287, 292-299
uniformity of rules governing, 295
extraterritorial operation of
construction, 153-160
Lockhart J., construction of, 156-157
Santow, construction of, 153-156
Trade Practices Commission, construction of, 157-158
legal framework, 288-289
notification, compulsory pre-merger, 273-275, 299-300
operation

RESTRICTIVE TRADE PRACTICES—*continued*
procedural, 287
substantive, 286-287
Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth), s. 50A, comparison with
avoidance, ease of, 167-168
prohibitions, 161-164
remedies, 164-167
Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth), s. 50A
extraterritorial operation of, 158-160
unconscionable conduct in commercial transactions, 276-277

SALE OF GOODS
United Nations Convention on Contracts for the Sale of Goods—
see Vienna Convention
Vienna Convention
application of, 442-443
Civil Codes, 443
goal, 442
matters expressly settled by, 448-449
matters governed by, 446-448
uniform approach to matters not expressly settled by
Article 6
"gap filling" analysis, 452-459
revocability of offers, 444-446
Article 7, 446-447
need for, 443

SHIPPING
Carriage of Goods by Sea Act 1991 (Cth), operation of, 432-436

TAXATION
capital gains tax
Income Tax Assessment Act 1936 (Cth), ss 160M(6) and (7)
application of, 363
complexity of, 362, 363-364
Hepples' case, 362, 363-364, 367-368
Goods and Services Tax, Canada
operation of, 187-188
structure
administration of, 191-192
exemptions to, 189-190
tax credits and rebates, 190-191
taxable goods and services, 188
zero-rated goods and services, 188-189
Manufacturers Sales Tax, Canada, 186-187
reform
simplification of tax laws, 362-371
Taxation Laws Amendment Act 1992 (Cth), 427-432

TAXATION—*continued*
statutes
construction
Acts Interpretation Act 1901 (Cth), s. 15AA(1), 369-371
Hepples' case, 367-368
ordinary rule, 368-369
special rule, 364-367, 371

TRADE PRACTICES—*see* MISLEADING OR DECEPTIVE CONDUCT, PETROLEUM RETAILING IN AUSTRALIA, RESTRICTIVE TRADE PRACTICES